Superintendent and District Leader Summative Rubric 2.0 for LEA.ISD.ESA

The Superintendent and District Leader Summative Rubrics 2.0 provide administrators and their evaluators with a condensed version of each evaluation characteristic (see School ADvance Administrator Evaluation User Manual and the Superintendent and District Leader Framework and Formative Rubric 2.0). This Summative Rubric is organized around the four practice domains (Domains 2-5) and nine practice Factors for assessing the performance of superintendents, first line assistants, directors, supervisors and other district administrators. The Superintendent and District Leader Framework provides statements that capture the major elements of each domain through specific performance factors and characteristics. The Domains, Factors, and Characteristics in the Summative Rubric match those in the Framework and Formative Rubric. The Summative Rubric should be used as the basis for the summative performance assessment. The Formative Rubric should be used for formative assessment activities (e.g. self-assessment, conferencing and dialogue, observations, evidence portfolios, etc.) and to provide clarity for developing performance ratings on the Summative Rubric, informing personal growth plans, or plans of assistance/improvement.

Each characteristic in the Summative Rubric collapses several behavioral indicators listed within the Formative Rubric for each of the performance factors. Because the descriptors are collapsed, users should refer back to the Formative Rubrics when there is a question about what a Summative Rubric item means or what might be observable or documentable evidence for that item.

NOTE: Domain 1 is only provided in the Summative Rubric. There is no Formative Rubric needed or provided for Domain 1–Results, as Domain 1 is only factored into the performance review at the summative level.

Color Key for Rubrics:

Domain
Factor
Characteristic

Superintendent and District Leader Summative Rubric 2.0

Domain 1 – Results			
A. Growth targets on mandatory state academic measures (both annual and interim assessments)*			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
1A	Results on established growth targets show improvement, but fall short of meeting the targets	Results meet established growth targets	Results exceed established growth targets
B. Growth targets on other valid local academic measures including normed or criterion-referenced assessments and/or assessment rubrics, based on Student Learning Objectives (SLOs) or other locally employed analytics*			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
1B	Results on established growth targets show improvement, but fall short of meeting the targets	Results meet established growth targets	Results exceed established growth targets
C. Growth targets on valid, research supported behavioral measures associated with academic achievement*			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
1C	Results on established growth targets show improvement, but fall short of meeting the targets	Results meet established growth targets	Results exceed established growth targets
D. Growth targets on valid, research supported psycho, social, and/or emotional measures associated with academic achievement*			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
1D	Results on established growth targets show improvement, but fall short of meeting the targets	Results meet established growth targets	Results exceed established growth targets

*Growth targets should be expressed as a range rather than a single point target. If more than one growth target is set for any of Factors A-D, score each growth target separately and determine the formula for aggregating ratings on all targets for each Factor into one rating for that Factor. Also develop a formula for aggregating ratings on all Factors (A-D) into one overall Domain 1 rating applying any statutory requirements where applicable. See page 3 for further explanation. Also, see pages 3-4 for information on adapting Domain 1 for use by intermediate and regional service districts and agencies.

Additional Information on Measures and Growth Targets

Many states, including Michigan, have statutory requirements for the calculation and inclusion of student growth ratings. Users are advised to work with guidance provided by their state departments of education regarding specific statutory requirements for their state and any regulations or technical assistance to interpret those statutory requirements. The Four student growth factors of the School ADvance Domain 1 reflect the current state of the literature and research regarding student growth ratings. They also provide districts with options for identifying what student success indicators and measures to include in a local student growth rating system.

Districts are further advised to work toward a comprehensive student success and growth model. To get started, consult with the School ADvance User' Manual and Training Materials and attend a School ADvance training workshop for initial guidance. Through the School ADvance workshops and support material, users are introduced to the following process for applying the four Factors of Domain 1 to develop student growth ratings:

1. Establish a district student success model with a variety of student success indicators and measures
2. Use trend data for various student success indicators and measures to establish growth targets
3. Set ranges for achieving each growth target
4. Select and use behavioral measures as appropriate for the student population (Factor C)
5. Select and use psycho, social, emotional measures as appropriate for the student population (Factor D)
6. Develop a formula for aggregating the growth ratings for each Factor into an overall Domain 1 growth rating if required by statute or district evaluation policy*

*Growth ratings for both teachers and administrators are always estimates of a given person's influence on student success and growth. As such, they are not exact measures and should be used advisedly in combination with evidence of actual performance indicators based on demonstrated practices and behaviors. School ADvance encourages the use of multiple indicators and multiple measures to estimate student growth and success and triangulation of evidence of student growth for any given success indicator. Where districts are allowed local prerogative under state requirements for creating student growth ratings, School ADvance recommends using a collaborative process with teachers and school leaders to develop a local student success model and develop student growth targets and ratings on the basis of that model. The School ADvance GrowthPLUS resources and tools can provide additional guidance for districts that wish to develop a comprehensive student success model. For further information, go to the GrowthPLUS page of this web site.

School ADvance
Administrator Evaluation System

Adapting Domain 1 for Leaders at the district level of intermediate school districts (ISDs), regional educational service agencies (ESAs), and other state or regional service providers that serve multiple local districts: The following provides guidance for ISDs or ESAs on when it is appropriate to apply each of the Domain 1 Factors:

1. If the ISD or ESA provides programs that include grade levels and subjects for which there are mandatory State assessments or alternative assessments, Factor A would apply to any administrator overseeing those programs, the ISD or ESA superintendent, and any central administrators who oversee a division that hosts such programs.
2. If the ISD or ESA provides programs that have academic student outcomes not covered by any mandatory state assessment or alternative assessment (e.g. vocational, visual and performing arts, special education programs, alternative school, or other chartered school programs), Factor B would apply as described in number 1).
3. If the ISD or ESA provides programs that have behavioral student outcomes (e.g. some special education, juvenile programs, vocational programs, etc.), Factor C would apply as described in number 1.
4. If the ISD or ESA provides programs that have psycho, social, or emotional outcomes (e.g. some special education, juvenile programs, vocational programs, etc.), Factor D would apply as described in number 1.
5. If the ISD or ESA provides **no programs that serve students directly**, Factors A-D do not apply and that ISD may want to use the Alternative Domain 1 illustrated below, in place of the standard Domain 1 displayed on page 2.
6. The following can also be used to supplement the required student growth rating in ISDs and ESAs that provide student programs and want to hold administrators accountable for both student growth and growth on non-student based quality indicators.

Alternative Domain 1 – Non-Student Based Results			
Growth Targets on One or More Non-Student Based ISD/ESA Quality Indicators~			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
	The district, division, and/or department made progress toward non-student based quality indicator targets for this cycle, but fell short of the effective performance range for this cycle	The district, division, and/or department made progress toward non-student based quality indicator targets within the performance range set for this cycle	The district, division, and/or department made progress toward non-student based quality indicator targets that exceeded the performance range set for this cycle

~Quality indicators can be developed for each division, department, and the overall organization based on a strategic plan or another means of establishing key performance indicators. School ADvance can help ISDs and ESAs establish their quality indicators and develop improvement targets.

Domain 2: Leadership			
Factor A: Vision for Learning and Achievement			
Characteristic 1: Mission and Vision			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
2A1	Maintains focus on the district mission and communicates an informed vision of success for all students	*And,* engages stakeholders to establish a shared and informed vision of success for all students that aligns with the district mission	*And* establishes shared leadership to maintain focus and commitment to the district mission and vision of success for all students
Characteristic 2: Goals and Expectations			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
2A2	Establishes, stays focused on, and monitors own performance related to goals and expectations of success for all students	*And* works with the leadership team, staff, and board as appropriate to establish and monitor shared goals and expectations in support of the district mission and vision for student success	*And* works with internal and external stakeholders as appropriate to establish and monitor shared goals and expectations in service of the district mission and vision for student success

Superintendent and District Leader Summative Rubric 2.0

Domain 2: Leadership			
Factor B: Culture for Learning			
Characteristic 1: Values, Beliefs, Principles, and Diversity			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
2B1	Communicates and acts in accordance with values, beliefs, and guiding principles that honor diversity, the worth of each individual, and respect for others	*And* works with the leadership team and board as appropriate in establishing district values, beliefs, and guiding principles that honor diversity, the worth of each individual, and respect for others	*And* works with internal and external stakeholders as appropriate to develop shared district values, beliefs, and guiding principles that honor diversity, the worth of each individual, and respect for others
Characteristic 2: Language, Traditions, Celebrations, and Stories			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
2B2	Uses a variety of means to celebrate, communicate, and build upon the history, traditions, mission, and vision of the district	*And* works with the leadership team, board, staff, students, and parents to develop shared language, traditions, and stories that communicate and celebrate the mission and vision of the district	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to engage and enlist internal and external stakeholders in celebrating the district and community's shared history, traditions, accomplishments, and aspirations

Domain 2: Leadership			
Factor C: Leadership Behavior			
Characteristic 1: Informed and Current			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
2C1	Uses evidence based practices to support the work of the district	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to identify and use evidence based practices to inform and achieve the district's mission, vision, and goals	*And* cultivates shared leadership to identify, prioritize, and use research supported practices to inform and achieve the district's mission, vision, and goals
Characteristic 2: Strategic and Systemic			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
2C2	Establishes and maintains focus on both short and long term priorities and strategies to drive the work of the district	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to organize district goals and strategies into a systemic plan with both short/long term priorities	*And* cultivates shared leadership to remain focused and persistent in achieving the district's systemic plan

Domain 2: Leadership			
Factor C: Leadership Behavior			
Characteristic 3: Fair, Legal, Honest, and Ethical			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
2C3	Conducts work in a fair, legal, and ethical manner	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to hold district personnel accountable for fair, legal, and ethical conduct	*And* works with the leadership team, board, internal and external stakeholders as appropriate to establish district policies, practices, and norms that help build a school and district culture of fair, legal, and ethical conduct
Characteristic 4: Adaptive and Resilient			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
2C4	Demonstrates the personal work habits, skills, and practices needed to carry out job responsibilities	*And* models and sets expectations for the leadership team and staff as appropriate to use habits of reflective practice, personal growth, adaptation, renewal, reliability, and consistency	*And* works with the leadership team and board as appropriate to recognize and reward habits of reflective practice, personal growth, adaptation, renewal, reliability, and consistency

Domain 3: Systems			
Factor A: High Quality and Reliability Instructional Program			
Characteristic 1: Guaranteed and Viable Curriculum			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3A1	Ensures that staff understand and use the district curriculum consistently and appropriately to plan and deliver instruction	*And* works with the leadership team and staff to ensure that the district curriculum aligns with state and national standards, is appropriate for all district students, and is communicated to students and parents	*And* cultivates shared leadership to ensure that the district curricular and extra-curricular programs are appropriate for the student population and understood by students and parents
Characteristic 2: Evidence Based and Differentiated Instruction			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3A2	Establishes processes for teachers and school leaders as appropriate to identify and apply evidence-based instructional practices	*And* works with the leadership team and staff as appropriate to establish expectations and support for differentiated instruction and intervention using evidence-based strategies to meet the needs of all students	*And* establishes reliable processes for teachers and school leaders as appropriate to regular monitor, evaluate, adapt, and improve instructional strategies to meet the needs of all students

	Domain 3: Systems		
	Factor A: High Quality and Reliability Instructional Program		
	Characteristic 3: Standards Based Assessment and Feedback		
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3A3	Has a working knowledge of evidence based, ethical, and legal assessment and feedback practices	Works with the staff and leadership team as appropriate to establish district systems and processes for evidence based, ethical, and legal assessment and feedback practices	*And* works with the staff and leadership team as appropriate to monitor, evaluate, and improve the district assessment and feedback systems as needed to maintain adherence to evidence based, ethical, and legal practices
	Characteristic 4: Technology to Expand Learning Opportunity		
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3A4	Ensures that the district develops and maintains an improvement and/or strategic plan that addresses technology for teaching and learning	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and internal/external stakeholders as appropriate to ensure that the plan reflects best practices for expanding and enhancing learning access and opportunity for students	*And* provides advocacy and opportunity for school leaders, staff, and students to pursue and implement innovative uses of technology to achieve district goals

Domain 3 – Systems			
Factor B: Safe, Effective, Efficient Programs and Services			
Characteristic 1: Laws, Policies, and Regulations			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3B1	Maintains current knowledge of and acts in accordance with state and federal laws, safety regulations, employee contracts, and district policies	*And* works with the leadership team to inform and hold district personnel accountable for adherence to state and federal laws, safety regulations, employee contracts, and district policies	*And* works with the leadership team and board as appropriate to monitor, and evaluate district policies, regulations and procedures and maintain alignment with the district mission, vision, and goals as well as state and federal laws, safety regulations, and contractual agreements
Characteristic 2: Processes and Procedures			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3B2	Works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to maintain and follow systems, processes and procedures to support district programs and services	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to monitor and solicit stakeholder feedback on the effectiveness and alignment of district processes and procedures to support district programs and services	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to adapt and improve district processes and procedures to support district programs and services as needed based on stakeholder feedback and monitoring data
Characteristic 3: Resource Allocation and Management			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
3B3	Maintains district-wide adherence to established fiscal and material resource management policies, systems, processes, and procedures	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to develop, monitor, and adjust fiscal and material resource management policies, systems, processes, and procedures as needed to achieve the district mission, vision, and goals	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to develop stakeholder support and collaboration in evaluating resource needs and advocating for additional resources where needed to achieve the district mission, vision, and goals

Superintendent and District Leader Summative Rubric 2.0

Domain 3: Systems			
Factor B: Safe, Effective, Efficient Programs and Services			
Characteristic 4: Personnel Policies and Practices			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
3B4	Works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to follow and monitor district personnel practices, systems, and policies	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to align district personnel practices, systems, and policies with state/federal laws and the district's mission, vision, and goals	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and staff as appropriate to evaluate and improve district personnel practices, systems, and policies based on monitoring and stakeholder feedback data
Characteristic 5: Non-instructional Technology			
Ineffective	Minimally Effective	Effective	Highly Effective
3B5	Ensures that the district develops and maintains an improvement and/or strategic plan that addresses technology for operations, communication, and non-instructional programs and services	*And* works with the leadership team, board, and internal/external stakeholders as appropriate to ensure that the plan reflects best practices to support operations, communications and non-instructional programs and services	*And* establishes processes for testing and evaluating innovative ideas and funding for improved operations, communications, and non-instructional program technologies

School
ADvance
Administrator Evaluation System

Domain 4: Processes			
Factor A: Community Building			
Characteristic 1: Board Relations			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4A1	Works with or supports the board as applicable to: a. Sustain working relationships b. Establish the district mission, vision, and goals c. Adhere to established board routines d. Respond to internal and/or external stakeholders	*And* works with or supports the board as applicable to: a. Monitor working relationships b. Monitor progress in achieving district mission, vision, and goals c. Monitor how board routines are working d. Engage internal and/or external stakeholders	*And* works with or supports the board as applicable to: a. Enhance working relationships b. Adjust and refine strategies to achieve the district mission, vision, and goals c. Refine board routines d. Improve levels of engagement with internal and/or external stakeholders
Characteristic 2: Leadership Team Relations			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4A2	Works with the district leadership as applicable to: a. Sustain working relationships b. Establish the district mission, vision, and goals c. Adhere to established leadership team routines d. Respond to internal and/or external stakeholders	*And* works with the district leadership as applicable to: a. Monitor working relationships b. Monitor progress in achieving district mission, vision, and goals c. Monitor how leadership team routines are working d. Monitor engagement of internal and/or external stakeholders	*And* works with the district leadership as applicable to: a. Enhance working relationships b. Adjust and refine strategies to achieve the district mission, vision, and goals c. Refine leadership team routines d. Improve engagement of internal and/or external stakeholders

Domain 4: Processes			
Factor A: Community Building			
Characteristic 3: Internal and External Stakeholder Relations			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4A3	Demonstrates current knowledge about the district and community and maintains open, responsive, and respectful interactions with parents, students, and the community	*And* is highly visible in both the schools and/or the community, encourages parent and community involvement in the schools, and solicits student, parent, and community feedback to inform the work of the district	*And* establishes systems to collect and interpret feedback and community data, inform the board and community of district issues and concerns, mobilize parent and community involvement, and establish community partnerships to achieve district goals
Characteristic 4: Communications and Media Relations			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4A4	Communicates regularly with internal and external stakeholders and the media per district policy on areas of public concern and interest	*And* works with the board and/or leadership team to build a multi-faceted communications plan to engage and inform internal and external stakeholders and work with the media for ongoing and special or crisis situations	*And* works with the board and/or leadership team to enhance two-way communications with internal and external stakeholders, improve parent involvement, and refine or improve media relations

Domain 4: Processes			
Factor B: Evidence Based Improvement			
Characteristic 1: Collaborative Inquiry			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4B1	Establishes and participates in leadership and staff teams that examine student results and/or other department, program, school, or district level success indicators	*And* works with the leadership team and staff as appropriate to identify success indicators and measures, establish team processes for conducting collaborative inquiry, challenge assumptions, raise questions, and push for deeper understanding when analyzing data from those measures	*And* develops shared leadership to identify success indicators and measures, refine team processes for conducting collaborative inquiry, challenge assumptions, raise questions, and push for deeper understanding when analyzing data from those measures
Characteristic 2: Systematic Use of Multiple Data Sources			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4B2	Uses multiple forms of data to develop, support, monitor, benchmark, and revise district improvement plan and/or strategic plan goals	*And* works with the board, district leaders, and/or staff as applicable to use multiple forms of data to develop, support, monitor, benchmark, and revise district improvement plan and/or strategic plan goals	*And* develops shared leadership and district expertise to develop broader use of multiple data forms, deeper analysis of the data and more strategic use of the analysis to inform strategic plan goals and improvement strategies, monitor implementation of improvement strategies and benchmark progress

Domain 4: Processes			
Factor B: School and District Improvement			
Characteristic 3: Data Systems			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4B3	Uses and sets expectations for district personnel to use the district data collection, storage, security, retrieval, and analysis systems	*And* works with district leaders and staff as appropriate to provide training and support for district leaders and staff to learn, use, and provide evaluation feedback on the district data collection, storage, security, retrieval and analysis systems	*And* works with district leaders to use staff, student and parent feedback as appropriate to evaluate and improve the district data systems; *And* works with the staff and/or district leadership team as appropriate to use the district data systems to develop student, classroom, program, department, school, and district performance profiles
Characteristic 4: Aligned Improvement, Monitoring, and Reporting			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
4B4	Works with the board, district leaders, and/or staff to interpret and follow district improvement plan and/or strategic plan goals, monitoring processes, and reporting procedures	*And* works with the board, district leaders, and/or staff to provide training for and opportunities to evaluate district improvement plan and/or strategic plan goals, monitoring processes, and reporting procedures	*And* works with the board, district leaders, and/or staff to ensure that all district planning and improvement processes are well aligned, yield compatible improvement plans, and are supported by district data, monitoring, and reporting systems

School ADvance

Administrator Evaluation System

Superintendent and District Leader Summative Rubric 2.0

	Domain 5: Capacity		
	Factor A: Human Development		
	Characteristic 1: Professional Learning		
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
5A1	Develops and implements a personal growth plan and assists staff in creating their own personal growth plans in accordance with the district performance evaluation and/or professional learning systems	*And* works with district leaders and/or staff as appropriate to align personal growth plans, school and district professional learning plans, and induction, mentoring, and coaching systems based on performance data, research, and the school's mission, vision, and goals	*And* works with district leaders and staff as appropriate to establish a professional learning culture and evaluate the impact of internal and external professional learning
	Characteristic 2: Leadership Development		
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
5A2	Works with the board and/or district leaders to involve staff in school decision making processes and develop staff, student, parent and/or community leaders	*And* provides meaningful leadership roles for staff, students, parents and community members, training to develop leaders, and mentoring and coaching to support leaders	*And* empowers emerging and established leaders, recognizes and supports their work, and celebrates their contributions

Examination Copy Only

Domain 5: Capacity			
Factor A: Human Development			
Characteristic 3: Performance Evaluation			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
5A3	Ensures that district personnel understand and follow all state laws and district personnel evaluation processes and procedures including the conduct of observations and feedback and development of personal growth and/or individual development plans (IDP)	*And* works with the leadership team and/or board to align staff, principal, and central office evaluation processes with state requirements and evidence based practices and provide training and coaching to all district personnel on the district performance evaluation system	*And* works with the board, district leaders and/or staff to monitor and evaluate the district evaluation system, including evidenced based performance portfolios, supervisor and peer observations, conferencing, mentoring and coaching, and team based performance improvement
Characteristic 4: Productivity			
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
5A4	Seeks out and recommends innovative and adaptive ideas for increasing productivity and effectiveness	*And* creates opportunities for district personnel, students, parents, and community members to explore, recommend and implement innovative and adaptive ideas for increasing productivity and effectiveness	*And* empowers district leaders, staff, and others to test, evaluate, and disseminate innovative and adaptive ideas that help achieve district goals and increase productivity

	Domain 5: Capacity Building		
	Factor B: Contextual and Political		
	Characteristic 1: Contextual and Political Awareness		
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
5B1	Maintains and uses current knowledge about the community, pertinent laws and regulations, and pending legislation to carry out leadership duties and responsibilities	*And* keeps district leaders and/or staff informed on pertinent information regarding the community, relevant laws and regulations, and pending legislation, and opportunities for advocacy with State and federal legislators	*And* informs the board, internal, and /or external stakeholders on pertinent information regarding the community, relevant laws and regulations, and pending legislation, and opportunities for advocacy with State and federal legislators
	Characteristic 2: Education and Advocacy		
Ineffective	**Minimally Effective**	**Effective**	**Highly Effective**
5B2	Assists the leadership team and/or board in examining education issues, establishing district positions that advocate for the best interests of students	*And* assists district leaders and/or board in communicating and explaining district positions on education issues to internal and external stakeholders, legislators and government officials	*And* assists district leaders and/or the board in developing advocates for district positions among community leaders, state and federal legislators, and government officials, and in educating the public on issues of critical concern